

Libraries Public Consultation- Final Stage

- Revised Option 3 - Corrected Priority List
- Revised Option 4 Proposal (already communicated)

Date: 14th of November 2024



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Purpose of the pack

In the final phase of consultation, we based option 3 on library rankings. The rankings were generated by a priority list which balanced community need and usage and access data. Subsequently, an error has been identified in the priority list rankings. This has been corrected and a revised option 3 produced which is included in this pack.

This does not change the recommended option (option 4); however, we welcome comments on the revised option 3, details found on page 13 and 14.

This pack includes:

- The previous and corrected priority list ranking (page 7,8 and 9) which includes updated usage and data figures (August 2023 to July 2024).
- The corrected option 3 results (page 13 and 14)
- The revised option 4 proposal, previously shared 23rd October-3rd November (page 17)

Previous comments submitted on the proposals will still be considered. Any previous comments relating to option 3 that has now changed, will be viewed in light of those changes. We are now asking for any new comments in light of the revised information.

Consultation Chronology - recap

First consultation: 4th April – 17th July 2024

- Focussed on sharing information about current usage and getting feedback on the four proposed delivery models.

Final Phase of consultation: 23rd August – 27th September 2024

- Drawing on responses from the first phase of consultation we wanted to provide detail on the options from the first phase and give people an opportunity to share how the proposed changes could be improved further.
- In Option 3 we gave details of our priority list for 18 x BCC funded library buildings based on a selection process giving 50% weighting to Ward Level Community Need and 50% weighting to Usage and Access and details of 7 x partner-led libraries.
- In Option 4 we gave details of our recommended model which retains 28 x BCC funded library buildings in addition to 7 partner-led libraries.
- We asked for feedback on these proposals.



Consultation Chronology - recap

Revised Option 4 Comments Phase: 23rd October – 3rd November 2024

- Revised Option 4 included an alternative Community Library Hub for Ladywood Constituency at Small Heath Library and details of a fairer re-distribution of hours for all community libraries based on feedback from the Final Phase of consultation.
- We asked for feedback on these proposals.

Revised Option 3 Comments Phase: 14th November – 12th December – **THIS CONSULTATION**

- The corrected priority list ranking and includes updated usage and data figures (August 2023 to July 2024).
- The corrected option 3 results
- We are asking for feedback and comments on your preferred option



Proposed Library Provision: Selection Methodology



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Library Provision selection process

The proposed provision has been selected using a priority list framework. Equal weighting has been applied to both Community Need and Usage & Access. This ranked the libraries from 1-35 with 1 being the highest priority for inclusion in the model.

Ward Level Community
Need

Weighting
50%

Includes multiple dimensions of deprivation, including **income, employment, health, education, crime, the living environment, and access to housing and services**. A localised comprehensive ward level Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD) has been developed that reflects living conditions within communities.

Usage and Access

Weighting
50%

Understanding how those who ‘live, work or study’ in Birmingham **currently access and use the Community Libraries**.



Option 3 – Previous and New Rankings (page 1 of 3)

Hodge Hill & Solihull North			Ladywood			Erdington			Hall Green & Moseley		
Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank
Shard End	30	4	Small Heath	28	10	Erdington	17	15	Kings Heath	9	9
Ward End	21	6	Balsall Heath	22	24	Perry Common	6	23	Hall Green	13	11
Glebe Farm	29	27	Bloomsbury	33	32	Kingstanding	15	33	Sparkhill	2	12
			Spring Hill	12	35						

This table presents the priority ranking (number ranking in brackets) from 1-35, with 1 being the highest priority for inclusion in the model (option 3 only).



Option 3 – Previous and New Rankings (page 1 of 3)

Yardley			Northfield			Perry Barr		
Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank
Acocks Green	1	1	Weoley Castle	10	14	Birchfield	5	5
South Yardley	16	2	Northfield	14	16	Handsworth	8	8
Sheldon	11	29	Kings Norton	7	17	Tower Hill	3	21
			Frankley	25	25	Aston	32	31

This table presents the priority ranking (number ranking in brackets) from 1-35, with 1 being the highest priority for inclusion in the model (option 3 only).



Option 3 – Previous and New Rankings (page 3 of 3)

Edgbaston			Selly Oak			Sutton Coldfield		
Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank	Library	Previous Rank	New Rank
Harborne	4	3	Yardley Wood	18	18	Sutton Coldfield	23	7
Quinton	27	13	Stirchley Library	35	20	Mere Green	34	19
Bartley Green	31	30	Druids Heath	20	22	Boldmere	26	26
			Selly Oak	19	34	Walmley	24	28

This table presents the priority ranking (number ranking in brackets) from 1-35, with 1 being the highest priority for inclusion in the model (option 3 only).



Library provision selection process

After scoring, additional considerations have been applied to the model resulting in 5 key components that determine the proposed provision in the recommended option:

2. PUBLIC CONSULTATION

- Online consultation
- Qualitative feedback
- Targeted consultations (young people, protected characteristics)

4. DATA ON USE & ACCESS (Priority List)

- Items Issued
- Members
- Events
- Community activities



3. DATA ON COMMUNITY NEED (Priority List)

- Income,
- Education
- Employment
- Health
- Crime
- Housing & Services
- Living Environment

5. PROPERTY DECISIONS and BUSINESS KNOWLEDGE

- Analysis of sites and premises costs
- Where the building is located
- What other assets/ amenities are in the area
- Income generation potential
- Regeneration plans/proposals



Option 3-Proposed Model Corrected



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Corrected Proposed Model –Option 3

18 x BCC funded Library buildings (including Library of Birmingham)

This option provides citywide provision and part time hubs are open for approximately 24 hours per week. Opening part time hubs longer (than in option 4) does mean some libraries will close to achieve savings. Part-time libraries and co-locations have been selected using the highest-ranked libraries from the priority list.

Offer	Definition
10 X BCC full-time community Library hub offer (includes hub in Library of Birmingham)	Full-time BCC staffed Library in each constituency. Co-location of additional services, operating 35 hrs per week.
7 X BCC part-time Library offer	Part-time BCC staffed Library operating an approx. 24hrs per week. Opportunity for full time opening supported by internal and external partners, groups and the community.
1 X co-location Library offer	Part-time BCC staffed library provision in a non-BCC building operating an approx.24hrs per week. Opportunity for full-time opening supported by the community.
7 X partner led Library opportunities	The building remains open through partner-led service provision with no BCC funding <i>*conversations are being held with partners - some progressed in detail and some in initial stages</i>
1 X additional Library vehicle	Additional 21 mobile library stops (total of 45 stops with current vehicle)
11 X Library closures	Savings achieved by closing 9 BCC Libraries (2 are not owned by BCC)

Corrected high-level overview of the proposed offer (option 3)

Library	Constituency	Previous Incorrect Option 3 Offer	Corrected Option 3 Offer
Acocks Green Library (1)	Yardley	Full -time Community Library Hub	Full -time Community Library Hub
Aston Library (31)	Perry Barr	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Balsall Heath Library (24)	Ladywood	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Bartley Green Library (30)	Edgbaston	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Birchfield Library (5)	Perry Barr	Part-Time Library	Part-Time Library
Bloomsbury Library (32)	Ladywood	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Boldmere Library (26)	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Druids Heath Library (22)	Selly Oak	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Erdington Library (15)	Erdington	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Frankley Library (25)	Northfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Glebe Farm Library (27)	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Hall Green Library (11)	Hall Green & Moseley	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Part-Time Library
Handsworth Library (8)	Perry Barr	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Harborne Library (3)	Edgbaston	Part-time Co-Located Library	Part-time Co-Located Library
Kings Heath Library (9)	Hall Green & Moseley	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Kings Norton Library (17)	Northfield	Part-time Library	Closure
Kingstanding Library (33)	Erdington	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Mere Green Library (19)	Sutton Coldfield	Full -time Community Library Hub	Full -time Community Library Hub

Corrected high-level overview of the proposed offer (option 3)

Library	Constituency	Previous Incorrect Option 3 Offer	Corrected Option 3 Offer
Northfield Library (16)	Northfield	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Perry Common Library (23)	Erdington	Part-time Library	Closure
Quinton Library (13)	Edgbaston	Full-time Community Library Hub	Full-time Community Library Hub
Selly Oak Library (34)	Selly Oak	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Shard End Library (4)	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Part-Time Library
Sheldon Library (29)	Yardley	Part-time Library	Closure
Small Heath Library (10)	Ladywood	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Part- Time Library
South Yardley Library (2)	Yardley	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Part-Time Library
Sparkhill Library (12)	Hall Green & Moseley	Part-time Library	Part-time Library
Spring Hill Library (35)	Ladywood	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Stirchley Library (20)	Selly Oak	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision
Sutton Coldfield Library (7)	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Tower Hill Library (21)	Perry Barr	Part-time Co-Located Library	Closure
Walmley Library (28)	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Ward End Library (6)	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Full -time Community Library Hub	Full -time Community Library Hub
Weoley Castle Library (14)	Northfield	Part-time Library	Part-time Library
Yardley Wood Library (18)	Selly Oak	Closure-Mobile stop provision	Closure-Mobile stop provision

Revised Option 4-Proposed Model (recommended option)

Previously shared 23rd October-3rd November



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Proposed Model –Option 4

28 x BCC funded Library buildings (including Library of Birmingham -LoB)

This option provides citywide provision and part-time libraries are open for approx 14 or 21 hours per week with the opportunity for more hours with community and partner led provision. All current building- based provision to remain open, with savings delivered through reduced staff hours in some Libraries and the introduction of partner-led provision.

Offer	Definition
10 X BCC 4-day community library hub offer LoB 6-days a week	4-day BCC staffed Library in each constituency. Co-location of additional services. Operating 28 hrs per week No change to LoB offer
13 X BCC Part-time library offer	Part-time BCC staffed Library operating an approx. 14hrs or 21 hours per week (based on library access and usage data). Opportunity for full time opening supported by internal and external partners, groups and the community.
4 X Co-location library offer (2 buildings closed and relocated)	Part-time BCC staffed library provision in a non-BCC building operating an approx. 14hrs or 21hrs per week (based on library access and usage data). Opportunity for full time opening supported by the community.
7 X Partner led library opportunities	The building remains open through partner-led service provision* with no BCC funding <i>*conversations are being held with partners - some progressed in detail and some in initial stages</i>
1x Additional library vehicle	Additional 21 mobile library stops (total of 45 stops with current vehicle)
1X Library remains closed	Building currently closed unable to reopen due to building condition

High-level overview of the proposed offer (Option 4)

BCC is committed to ensuring library services are provided in the designated Ward. However, this may not involve the existing library building. The decision will depend on the condition of the building, and efforts will be made to explore co-location options or alternative locations. (Revised offer shared 23rd Oct-3rd Nov 2024)

Library	Constituency	Offer	Library	Constituency	Offer
Acocks Green Library	Yardley	Community Library Hub (4 day)	Northfield Library	Northfield	Community Library Hub (4 day)
Aston Library	Perry Barr	Part-time Co-Located Library (2 day)	Perry Common Library	Erdington	Part-time Library (2 day)
Balsall Heath Library	Ladywood	Part-time Library (2 day)	Quinton Library	Edgbaston	Community Library Hub (4 day)
Bartley Green Library	Edgbaston	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Selly Oak Library	Selly Oak	Part-time Co-location library (2 day)
Birchfield Library	Perry Barr	Part-time Library (3 day)	Shard End Library	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Part-time Library (3 day)
Bloomsbury Library	Ladywood	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Sheldon Library	Yardley	Part-time Library (2 day)
Boldmere Library	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Small Heath Library	Ladywood	Community Library Hub (4 day)
Druids Heath Library	Selly Oak	Community Library Hub (4 day)	South Yardley Library	Yardley	Part-time Library (3 day)
Erdington Library	Erdington	Community Library Hub (4 day)	Sparkhill Library	Hall Green & Moseley	Part-time Library (3 day)
Frankley Library	Northfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Spring Hill Library	Ladywood	Remains Closed-Mobile stop provision
Glebe Farm Library	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Partner-led Library provision opportunity	Stirchley Library	Selly Oak	Part-time Library (3 day)
Hall Green Library	Hall Green & Moseley	Part-time Library (3 day)	Sutton Coldfield Library	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Handsworth Library	Perry Barr	Community Library Hub (4 day)	Tower Hill Library	Perry Barr	Part-time Co-Located Library (2 day)
Harborne Library	Edgbaston	Part-time Co-Located Library	Walmley Library	Sutton Coldfield	Partner-led Library provision opportunity
Kings Heath Library	Hall Green & Moseley	Community Library Hub (4 day)	Ward End Library	Hodge Hill & Solihull North	Community Library Hub (4 day)
Kings Norton Library	Northfield	Part-time Library (3 day)	Weoley Castle Library	Northfield	Part-time Library (3 day)
Kingstanding Library	Edgbaston	Part-time Library (2 day)	Yardley Wood Library	Selly Oak	Part-time Library (3 day)
Mere Green Library	Sutton Coldfield	Community Library Hub (4 day)			

Key differences in Option 3 and 4

Proposed	Option 3	Option 4
Number of buildings	Option 3 has fewer buildings than option 4 (18 BCC funded Libraries and a total of 25 Libraries including Partner-led)	Option 4 protects the greatest number of buildings (28 BCC funded Libraries, and a total of 34 Libraries including Partner-led)
Full-time Community Library Hubs-number of days open	5 days a week	4 days per week
Part-time Libraries-number of hours open	Approx. 24 hours (Opportunity for full time opening supported by internal and external partners, groups and the community)	Approx. 21hours or 14 hours(Based on usage and access data) (Opportunity for full time opening supported by internal and external partners, groups and the community)
Savings achieved	Savings achieved from less buildings (closures) and Partner-led running and staffing buildings. If a Partner-led Library building is unsuccessful this will lead to a Library closure	Savings achieved by shorter opening hours and Partner-led running and staffing buildings. If a Partner-led Library building is unsuccessful this will lead to a Library closure

How to get involved in the consultation



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Libraries Consultation Final Stage –revised option 3 and 4

[Birmingham City Council is asking for all those who live](#), work or study in Birmingham for their views, comments and feedback on the proposed changes outlined in this communication. We encourage comment from both current library users and nonusers.

Cabinet will be asked to make a decision on the final proposal in January 2025. We invite you to share your thoughts and comments on the options and the feedback will be included in the cabinet paper

Period for final comments : 14th of November 2024 to the 12th of December 2024

- Comments survey link -www.birminghambeheard.org.uk/bcc/lc24-co3
- Paper versions at all Birmingham Libraries, community language and other formats are available on request

You can also send comments to the existing Libraries Public Consultation email inbox:

LibrariesPublicConsultation@birmingham.gov.uk

For more information and links to the First Phase and Final Phase of Libraries Consultation please go to: [Birmingham - www.birmingham.gov.uk/budgetconsultations](http://www.birmingham.gov.uk/budgetconsultations)

Appendices

Community Libraries Usage & Access data fields
Community Need data fields



 **RESET**

 **RESHAPE**

 **RESTART**

Community Libraries Usage & Access data fields

The Community Library usage and access data source is taken wherever available from the Sydpus Integrated Library Management. Where data was not currently available, the source of data was provided by the Community Library service. The reporting period of system of August 2023 to July 2024 was used to ensure consistency across the Usage and Access dataset. Each of the Usage & Access data fields are equally weighted,

Library name	Number of participants 'completed' in the Summer Reading Challenge or similar initiatives (in England).
Items issued	Number of participants 'registered' in the Birmingham Winter Reading Challenge.
Tier	Number of participants who 'completed' the Birmingham Winter Reading Challenge.
Open hours per week	Number of reading groups supported per library service. (Total number of event sessions: Includes Adults & Children's)
Computer (PC) bookings	Number of reading groups supported per library service. (Total number of attendees at event sessions: Includes Adults & Children)
Number of event sessions: Councillor's Advice Sessions	Number of events focused on digital support (Total number of event sessions: Coding & IT Clubs (Includes Adults & Children's)
Number of attendees: Councillor's Advice Sessions	Number of events focused on digital support (Total number of attendees at event sessions: Coding & IT Clubs (Includes Adults & Children)
Number of event sessions: Room Hired Events	Number of borrows who took out book loans by Library (Registered Home Location)
Number of attendees: Room Hired Events	Current number of members
Number of event sessions: Activities for Adults	New memberships
Number of attendees: Activities for Adults	Members Re-registered
Number of event sessions: Adult activities out of the building	Members Deleted
Number of attendees: Adult activities out of the building	Number of desk spaces made available within libraries on average each day
Number of event sessions: National Initiatives	
Number of attendees: National Initiatives	
Number of event sessions: Under 5's events/activities	
Number of attendees: Under 5's events/activities	
Number of event sessions: Over 5's events/ activities	
Number of attendees: Over 5's events/ activities	
Number of event sessions: Teenage activities	
Number of attendees: Teenage activities	
Number of event sessions: School visits (internal/External to the library)	
Number of attendees: School visits (internal/External to the library)	
Number of event sessions: Nursey & Playgroups visits (internal/External to the library)	
Number of attendees: Nursey & Playgroups visits (internal/External to the library)	
Number of event sessions: UK online	
Number of attendees: UK online	
Number of event sessions: ESOL activities	
Number of attendees: ESOL activities	
Number of event sessions: Author visits	
Number of attendees: Author visits	



Community Need data fields

The Index of Multiple Deprivation (known as IMD) is a standard and universally used central Government measure of relative deprivation for communities in England published in 2019. The City Observatory are using the data sources that they have, to create a more up to date version.

The IMD combines data about income, employment, education, health, crime, living environment and barriers to housing and services.

All areas in England are ranked from most deprived to least deprived and are then split into 10 equal groups called deciles. Decile 1 contains the most deprived areas and Decile 10 the least deprived. An IMD score is identified for each library community, showing which library catchment areas are more deprived than others. **This information is essential to help assess the need and potential demand for local library services and the ability to access these.**

The weighting of the Community Needs data fields are in line with the English Indices of Deprivation 2019. In the current English Indices of Deprivation 2019 (IoD2019) seven domains of deprivation are considered and **weighted** as follows, Income. (22.5%) Employment. (22.5%) Education. (13.5%) Health. (13.5%) Crime. (9.3%) Barriers to Housing and Services. (9.3%) Living Environment. (9.3%)

Income Deprivation Domain Library Name Adults and children in Income Support families Adults and children in income-based Employment and Support Allowance families Adults and children in Working Tax Credit and Child Tax Credit families not already counted, and whose equivalised income (excluding housing benefit) is below 60 per cent of the median before housing costs Asylum seekers in England in receipt of subsistence support, accommodation support, or both Adults and children in Universal Credit families where no adult is classed within the 'Working - no requirements' conditionality regime Income Deprivation Domain numerator Individual Indicators comprising the Income Deprivation Affecting Children Index Income Deprivation Affecting Children Index Numerator Individual Indicators comprising the Income Deprivation Affecting Older People Index Income Deprivation Affecting Older People Index Numerator	Education, Skills and Training Deprivation Domain Key Stage 2 attainment Key Stage 4 attainment Secondary school absence Staying on in education post 16 Entry to higher education Adult Skills English language proficiency Adult skills and English language proficiency indicators - combined
Employment Deprivation Domain Claimants of Jobseeker's Allowance (both contribution-based and income-based), women aged 18-59 and men aged 18-64 Claimants of Employment and Support Allowance (both contribution-based and income-based), women aged 18-59 and men aged 18-64 Claimants of Incapacity Benefit, women aged 18-59 and men aged 18-64 Claimants of Severe Disablement Allowance, women aged 18-59 and men aged 18-64 Claimants of Carer's Allowance, women aged 18-59 and men aged 18-64 Claimants of Universal Credit in the 'Searching for work' and 'No work requirements' conditionality groups. Employment Deprivation Domain numerator	Health Deprivation and Disability Domain Years of potential life lost Comparative illness and disability ratio Acute morbidity Mood and anxiety disorders
	Crime Domain Violence Burglary Theft Criminal damage
	Barriers to Housing and Services Domain Road distance to a post office Road distance to a primary school Road distance to general store or supermarket Road distance to a GP surgery Household overcrowding Homelessness Housing affordability