Shopping & Local Centres Supplementary Planning Document (SPD)

Monitoring Report 2016

Birmingham City Council

Shopping & Local Centres SPD: Monitoring Report 2016

Context

The Shopping and Local Centres SPD was adopted in March 2012 and was produced to help address a range of issues affecting the vibrancy and vitality of Birmingham's largest 73 shopping centres outside the city centre. Its purpose is to encourage investment into local centres and guide future development to help maintain a viable balance between retail and non-retail uses.

The SPD identifies a hierarchy of centres - Town, District and Neighbourhood - in line with both national policy guidance and Birmingham's Development Plan. For each centre a definitive boundary is established, within which a Primary Shopping Area (PSA) is identified.

The main policies established seek to:
1) maintain a minimum of 55% of units in the Primary Shopping Area of Town and District Centres and 50% of units in the Primary Shopping Area of Neighbourhood Centres in A1 retail use.
2) avoid an overconcentration of A5 hot food take-away uses by restricting their number to no more than 10% of the total units in a centre or individual parade, and
3) ensure no individual proposal adversely affects local amenity or contribute to non-retail clustering.

Following the BDP Examination and the Inspector's recommended modifications, Policies 1 and 4 of the SPD are to be incorporated into BDP Policy TP23 when it is adopted. This will give them full Development Plan status. The remainder of the SPD will then be reviewed to clarify its role in identifying up-to-date Centre and Primary Shopping Area boundaries.

Baseline data

During the preparation of the SPD, detailed land use surveys were undertaken for each local centre. The survey data was mapped and summary land use information published on the Council's website along with the adopted SPD, http://www.birmingham.gov.uk/spdlocalcentres. The survey data had a baseline date of April 2011.

Since adoption, the Council has monitored all planning permissions and refusals within centres and this has enabled us to assess how the policies are working and how the balance of uses may be changing.

Scope of monitoring

Monitoring reports were previously produced in 2013, 2014, and 2015. This monitoring information is dated to 31st March 2016.

Previous monitoring has been based on desktop updates of planning permissions in view of the resource implications of re-surveying each centre every year. For 2016, full resurveys have been undertaken, as 5 years have elapsed since the baseline surveys were completed. This means that changes of use under Permitted Development rights have been included.

The changes to the Use Class Order in 2015 resulted in various uses moving to the Sui Generis Use Class. The methodology previously used to calculate the percentages in Tables 2 and 3 has therefore been updated to include Sui Generis and selected Class B1/D1/D2 Uses in retail premises (as defined in the Shopping & Local Centres SPD Appendix) to ensure accuracy.

This report will be the last in the present format. In future, it will be replaced by the AMR in relation to BDP Policy TP23.

Key Findings 2012 – 2016

Since the adoption of the Shopping & Local Centres SPD and the application of its policies, the following decisions and trends have been monitored:

<u>**Table 1**: Planning Permissions and refusals in Local Centres 2012-2016</u>

<table>
<tr><th></th><th colspan="2">2012-2015</th><th colspan="2">2015-16</th><th>Total</th></tr>
<tr><td>Total number of relevant planning decisions</td><td colspan="2">382</td><td colspan="2">142</td><td>524</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A1</td></tr>
<tr><td>Permissions leading to loss of A1 retail use</td><td colspan="2">103</td><td colspan="2">36</td><td>139</td></tr>
<tr><td>Permissions granted for new A1 retail use</td><td>61 units</td><td rowspan="3">191 units</td><td>26 units</td><td rowspan="3">38 units</td><td rowspan="3">229 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>Permissions granted for Change of use (CoU) to A1 retail use</td><td>31 units</td><td>6</td></tr>
<tr><td>Permissions granted for A1 retail as part of mixed use permissions</td><td>15 schemes, 99 units</td><td>5 schemes, 6 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A2</td></tr>
<tr><td>New construction or CoU to A2 (financial & professional services) permissions</td><td colspan="2">27 units</td><td colspan="2">2 units</td><td>29 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>New A2 or CoU to A2 as part of mixed permissions</td><td colspan="2">9 units</td><td colspan="2">1 unit</td><td>10 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A3</td></tr>
<tr><td>New construction or CoU to A3 (restaurant & café) use</td><td colspan="2">41 units</td><td colspan="2">22</td><td>63 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>New A3 as part of mixed permissions</td><td colspan="2">19 units</td><td colspan="2">5 units</td><td>24 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A4</td></tr>
<tr><td>CoU to A4 (drinking establishment) use</td><td colspan="2">4 units</td><td colspan="2">2 units</td><td>6 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>New A4 or CoU to A4 as part of mixed permissions</td><td colspan="2">2 units</td><td colspan="2">1 unit</td><td>3 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A5</td></tr>
<tr><td>New construction or CoU to A5 (hot food takeaway) use</td><td colspan="2">21 units</td><td colspan="2">2 units</td><td>23 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>New A5 or CoU to A5 as part of mixed permissions</td><td colspan="2">8 units</td><td colspan="2">4 units</td><td>12 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">A3/A5</td></tr>
<tr><td>New or CoU to A3/A5 permissions (not counted above)</td><td colspan="2">15 units</td><td colspan="2">6 units</td><td>21 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">D1</td></tr>
<tr><td>New construction or CoU to D1 (non-residential institutions) use</td><td colspan="2">24 units</td><td colspan="2">9 units</td><td>33 units</td></tr>
<tr><td>New D1 or CoU to D1 as part of mixed permissions</td><td colspan="2">3 units</td><td colspan="2">0</td><td>3 units</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="6">D2</td></tr>
<tr><td>New D2 or CoU to D2 (assembly & leisure) use</td><td colspan="2">11 units</td><td colspan="2">2 units</td><td>13 units</td></tr>
</table>

C3			
Conversion from B1 (business) to C3 (residential) use	6 units	11 schemes, 64 units, plus 3 large schemes, 426 units	496 units
Conversion from D1 (non-residential institutions) to C3 (residential) use	2 units	2 schemes, 4 units	6 units
Sui Generis			
New construction or CoU to Sui Generis use	Not previously monitored	8 units	8 units
Refusals and appeals in centres			
Number of A3 refusals	2*	3	5
Number of A3 applications withdrawn	6*	5	11
Number of A5 refusals	22	10	32
Number of A5 applications withdrawn	3*	2	5
Number of A3/A5 refusals	9	1	10
Number of A3/A5 (or other mixed uses including A5) applications withdrawn	5*	5	10
Number of A5 appeals	8	1	9
Number of A5 appeals dismissed since adoption of SPD	6	6	12
Number of A5 appeals allowed since adoption of SPD	1	2	3
Number of A5 appeals outstanding	1	0	1
Outside centres			
New construction or CoU to A5 (hot food takeaway) use outside Centres	67 units	4 units	73 units
Mixed use proposals including A5 use outside Centres	10 units*	6 units	16 units
Number of A5 refusals outside Centres	41 units	6 units	47 units
Mixed use proposals including A5 use refused outside Centres	9 units*	1 units	10 units

*2014-15 only – not previously monitored.

Monitoring the Shopping & Local Centres SPD – A1 Uses

Most centres remain within the Policy 1 threshold of 50/55% for A1 Uses within Primary Shopping Areas. The exceptions are:

- Queslett and Scott Arms, where the part of those centres within Birmingham is below the 50% threshold, but the centres as a whole are within the policy threshold.
- Ivy Bush, at 41% (increase of units in the PSA has reduced the percentage of A1 uses).
- Selly Oak, at just under 45%, is subject to two significant redevelopment proposals which increase the amount of A1 floorspace, but reduce the number of A1 Units. Cumulatively, with changes outside planning control, the policy thresholds have been breached, but in this instance the regeneration benefits are considered to be paramount.
- Balsall Heath, at 48%, is below its 50% threshold.

Other centres at or close to their policy thresholds are: Fox & Goose, Frankley, Highfield Road and Moseley. Planning applications in these centres will need to be considered carefully to avoid further breaches of the policy.

There are several centres where major redevelopments are proposed or have been completed:

With permission: Not yet started	Under construction	Recently completed
Erdington	Stirchley	Sheldon
Mere Green	Edgbaston (Shopping Centre/ Auchinleck House)	Swan, Yardley
Selly Oak	Longbridge (Phase 1 completed, phase 2 under construction)	

Revised **Table 2**: Policy 1 - Primary Shopping Area Statistics 2016

Centre	**No of PSA Units 2011**	**No of A1 Units 2011**	**PSA %A1 2011**	**Status 2011**	**No of PSA Units 2016**	**No of A1 Units 2016**	**PSA %A1 2016 inc SG/B/D**	**Trend 2011-2016**	**Status 2016**
Acocks Green	130	89	68.46		144	87	60.42	▼	
Alum Rock Road	240	183	76.25		264	199	75.38	▼	
Balsall Heath	27	14	51.85		27	13	48.15	▼	
Boldmere	89	62	69.66		90	55	61.11	▼	
Bordesley Green	39	26	66.67		34	26	76.47	▲	
Castle Vale	11	10	90.91		10	8	80.00	▼	
College Road	19	12	63.16		21	11	52.38	▼	
Cotteridge	87	60	68.97		85	51	60.00	▼	
Dudley Road	99	76	76.77		99	76	76.77	=	
Edgbaston (Five Ways)	53	37	69.81		42	28	66.67	▼	
Erdington	241	159	65.98		218	144	66.06	▲	
Fox and Goose	89	50	56.18		83	43	51.81	▼	
Frankley	10	6	60.00		12	6	50.00	▼	
Glebe Farm	25	20	80.00		27	20	74.07	▼	
Green Lane	46	38	82.61		48	39	81.25	▼	
Hall Green	79	49	62.03		80	44	55.00	▼	
Harborne	129	84	65.12		127	78	61.42	▼	
Hawthorn Road	51	33	64.71		56	34	60.71	▼	
Hay Mills	58	39	67.24		63	38	60.32	▼	
Highgate	23	19	82.61		24	18	75.00	▼	
Highfield Road	36	19	52.78		37	19	51.35	▼	
Ivy Bush	21	12	57.14		39	16	41.03	▼	
Jewellery Quarter	160	132	82.50		157	121	77.07	▼	
Kings Heath	239	170	71.13		241	149	61.83	▼	
Kings Norton Green	42	25	59.52		36	19	52.78	▼	
Kingsbury	58	38	65.52		59	34	57.63	▼	
Kingstanding Circle	65	41	63.08		64	37	57.81	▼	
Ladypool Road	171	127	74.27		177	114	64.41	▼	
Lea Village	36	24	66.67		39	25	64.10	▲	
Longbridge	10	7	70.00		31	17	54.84	▼	
Lozells	91	68	74.73		91	58	63.74	▼	
Maypole	25	17	68.00		26	18	69.23	▲	
Meadway	31	28	90.32		30	25	83.33	▼	
Mere Green	98	65	66.33		95	59	62.11	▼	
Moseley	81	42	51.85		84	42	50.00	▼	
New Oscott	65	42	64.62		78	44	56.41	▼	
Newtown	21	13	61.90		20	14	70.00	▲	
Northfield	175	133	76.00		170	121	71.18	▼	

Olton Boulevard	57	39	68.42		60	41	68.33	▼	
Pelham	77	51	66.23		79	56	70.89	▲	
Perry Barr	143	102	71.33		143	105	73.43	▲	
Queslett *	22	12	54.55		8	3	37.50	▼	
Queslett (whole centre)					24	12	50.00	▼	
Robin Hood	49	35	71.43		52	33	63.46	▼	
Rookery Road	115	84	73.04		113	74	65.49	▼	
Scott Arms *	48	29	60.42		26	12	46.15	▼	
Scott Arms (whole centre)							55.26	▼	
Selly Oak	153	92	60.13		144	64	44.44	▼	
Shard End	12	11	91.67		13	9	69.23	▼	
Sheldon	119	80	67.23		121	75	61.98	▼	
Short Heath	33	23	69.70		31	18	58.06	▼	
Slade Road	38	21	55.26		40	22	55.00	▼	
Small Heath	257	161	62.65		275	175	63.64	▲	
Soho Road	236	169	71.61		248	164	66.13	▼	
Sparkbrook	67	73	58.90		79	48	60.76	▲	
Sparkhill	237	170	71.73		251	196	78.09	▲	
Springfield	133	98	73.68		135	98	72.59	▼	
Stechford	37	24	64.86		41	25	60.98	▼	
Stirchley	117	76	64.96		98	60	61.22	▼	
Sutton Coldfield	273	128	73.99		179	126	70.39	▼	
Swan**	11	5	45.45		38	26	68.42	▲	
The Radleys	43	30	69.77		45	28	62.22	▼	
Timberley	39	27	69.23		27	19	70.37	▲	
Tyseley	23	19	82.61		20	17	85.00	▲	
Villa Road	36	26	72.22		39	28	71.79	▼	
Walmley	28	21	75.00		29	21	72.41	▼	
Ward End	64	42	65.63		65	45	69.23	▲	
Weoley Castle	60	43	71.67		59	37	62.71	▼	
West Heath	22	16	72.73		22	16	72.73	=	
Witton	99	56	56.57		104	67	64.42	▲	
Wylde Green	87	67	77.01		92	60	65.22	▼	
Yardley Road	50	27	54.00		39	22	56.41	▲	
Yardley Wood	24	17	70.83		24	15	62.50	▼	
Yew Tree	59	42	71.19		57	36	63.16	▼	

Note: Definitions of the number of units and calculation percentages are defined in Appendix 1 of the SPD.

For 2011-2013 and 2013-2014 trends, see previous Monitoring Reports.

▲	Trend – Use Class increasing in percentage
▼	Trend – Use Class decreasing in percentage
=	Percentage unchanged
	Policy compliant
	Policy compliant but close to, or at threshold
	Centre not policy compliant
*	Queslett & Scott Arms local centres are mainly (50% and 75% respectively) outside the city boundary. The 2016 monitoring applies only to the parts of those centres within Birmingham.
**	Major redevelopment at The Swan, Yardley in progress in 2011.

Monitoring the Shopping & Local Centres SPD – A5 Uses

With regard to Policy 4 on Hot Food takeaways, at the time of adoption of the SPD almost half the local centres (33 out of 73) exceeded the policy's 10% threshold. It was chosen as an average, based on the baseline surveys, so it is expected that approximately half of the centres will exceed it.

Organic change means that variations will occur over time. The 2013 monitoring revealed that a further two centres (Rookery Road and Stirchley) had exceed the threshold. The reason for this is the implementation of permissions granted since the original surveys but prior to adoption of the SPD. In 2013/14, no additional centres exceeded the threshold. In 2015, Selly Oak and Ivy Bush exceeded the threshold following complete resurveys, and Walmley reached 10%. In 2016, 27 out of 73 centres exceeded the threshold, as shown in Table 3 below.

Furthermore, Bordesley Green, Frankley, Rookery Road, Small Heath, Stirchley, Walmley and West Heath contain in excess of 9% A5 uses. Although they are just below the 10% threshold, any future proposals for Hot Food takeaways in these centres will require careful consideration if they are to remain policy compliant.

Revised **Table 3**: Policy 4 - Percentage of Class A5 Uses Statistics 2016

Centre	**No of Units 2011**	**No of A5 Units 2011**	**%A5 2011**	**Status 2011**	**No of Units 2016 inc SG**	**No of A5 Units 2016**	**Trend 2011-2016**	**%A5 2016 inc SG/B/D**	**Trend (%) 2011-2016**	**Status 2016**
Acocks Green	148	10	6.76		146	11	▲	7.38	▼	
Alum Rock Road	237	18	7.59		261	20	▲	7.58	▼	
Balsall Heath	60	7	11.67		64	9	=	14.06	▼	
Boldmere	89	4	4.49		91	4	=	4.35	▼	
Bordesley Green	51	6	11.76		55	5	▼	9.09	▼	
Castle Vale	11	0	0.00		11	0	=	0.00	=	
College Road	25	3	12.00		28	5	▲	17.86	▼	
Cotteridge	117	12	10.26		121	10	▼	8.20	▼	
Dudley Road	125	17	13.60		140	23	▲	16.43	▼	
Edgbaston (Five Ways)	61	2	3.28		64	4	▲	6.15	▼	
Erdington	236	14	5.93		233	11	▼	4.66	▼	
Fox and Goose	86	4	4.65		87	7	▲	7.95	▼	
Frankley	10	1	10.00		11	1	=	9.09	▼	
Glebe Farm	42	7	16.67		40	8	=	18.60	▼	
Green Lane	45	3	6.67		45	2	▼	4.26	▼	
Hall Green	78	8	10.26		83	7	▼	8.33	▼	
Harborne	186	7	3.76		184	7	▼	3.74	▼	
Hawthorn Road	51	4	7.84		53	3	▼	5.36	▼	
Hay Mills	69	10	14.49		75	9	▼	12.00	▼	
Highgate	25	3	12.00		24	4	▲	16.67	▼	
Highfield Road	43	3	6.98		44	3	=	6.67	▼	
Ivy Bush	45	7	15.56		50	9	▲	17.31	▼	
Jewellery Quarter	172	1	0.58		171	2	▲	1.16	▼	
Kings Heath	246	11	4.47		256	12	▲	4.65	▼	
Kings Norton Green	43	2	4.65		38	2	=	5.26	▼	
Kingsbury	56	6	10.71		58	7	▲	11.86	▼	
Kingstanding Circle	66	7	10.61		66	6	▼	8.96	▼	
Ladypool Road	170	11	6.47		175	9	▼	5.03	▼	
Lea Village	36	8	22.22		39	8	=	19.51	▼	
Longbridge	16	5	31.25		39	3	▼	7.50	▼	

Lozells	96	12	12.50		100	13	▲	12.87	▼	
Maypole	35	4	11.43		36	4	=	11.11	▼	
Meadway	32	1	3.13		27	1	=	3.33	▼	
Mere Green	96	3	3.13		95	6	▲	6.32	▼	
Moseley	109	7	6.42		122	6	▼	4.92	▼	
New Oscott	59	6	10.17		73	6	=	7.59	▼	
Newtown	21	1	4.76		20	1	=	5.00	▼	
Northfield	193	10	5.18		190	13	▲	6.67	▼	
Olton Boulevard	55	8	14.55		61	8	=	13.11	▼	
Pelham	73	9	12.33		76	10	▲	12.66	▼	
Perry Barr	142	8	5.63		147	7	▼	4.73	▼	
Queslett *					8	2	▼	20.00	▼	
Queslett (whole centre)	19	3	15.79		22	3	=	13.64	▼	
Quinton	24	3	12.50		11	1	▼	8.33	▼	
Robin Hood	50	6	12.00		52	6	▼	10.91	▼	
Rookery Road	114	11	9.65		111	11	=	9.73	▼	
Scott Arms *					26	0	▼	0.00	=	
Scott Arms (whole centre)	75	6	8.00		76	6	=	7.89	▼	
Selly Oak	155	12	7.74		154	16	▲	10.19	▼	
Shard End	12	0	0.00		13	2	▲	15.38	▼	
Sheldon	118	7	5.93		124	9	▲	7.14	▼	
Short Heath	39	5	12.82		36	5	=	13.89	▼	
Slade Road	59	8	13.56		69	12	▲	17.39	▼	
Small Heath	250	27	10.80		294	29	=	9.67	▼	
Soho Road	297	21	7.07		336	22	▼	6.47	▼	
Sparkbrook	67	6	8.96		80	4	▼	4.82	▼	
Sparkhill	241	12	4.98		256	8	▼	3.04	▼	
Springfield	150	15	10.00		139	11	▼	7.75	▼	
Stechford	36	5	13.89		41	5	=	12.20	▼	
Stirchley	139	13	9.35		159	15	▲	9.09	▼	
Sutton Coldfield	229	2	0.87		229	6	▲	2.62	▼	
Swan**	26	4	15.38		46	3	▼	5.88	▼	
The Radleys	42	7	16.67		46	10	▲	21.74	▼	
Timberley	39	4	10.26		28	4	=	14.29	▼	
Tyseley	22	2	9.09		20	1	▼	5.00	▼	
Villa Road	57	7	12.28		67	4	▼	5.71	▼	
Walmley	29	2	6.90		31	3	▲	9.68	▼	
Ward End	65	7	10.77		73	9	▲	12.16	▼	
Weoley Castle	59	8	13.56		59	8	=	13.56	▼	
West Heath	22	2	9.09		22	2	=	9.09	▼	
Witton	96	12	12.50		103	11	▼	10.48	▼	
Wylde Green	98	7	7.14		100	9	▲	8.65	▼	
Yardley Road	46	5	10.87		51	6	▲	10.71	▼	
Yardley Wood	26	3	11.54		28	3	=	10.71	▼	
Yew Tree	77	4	5.19		74	5	▲	6.76	▼	

For 2011-2013 and 2013-2014 trends, see previous Monitoring Reports.

▲	Trend – Use Class increasing in percentage
▼	Trend – Use Class decreasing in percentage
=	Percentage unchanged
	Policy compliant
	Policy compliant but close to, or at threshold
	Centre not policy compliant
*	Queslett & Scott Arms local centres are mainly (50% and 75% respectively) outside the city boundary. The 2016 monitoring applies only to the parts of those centres within Birmingham.
**	Major redevelopment at The Swan, Yardley in progress in 2011.

Conclusions

- In 2015-16, the loss of 36 A1 units is balanced by 38 new A1 units permitted.
- Of the city's Local Centres, Balsall Heath, Ivy Bush and Selly Oak currently fall below their minimum thresholds for Class A1 Uses in Policy 1.
- Queslett and Scott Arms are centres which extend beyond the city boundary. Baseline monitoring in 2011 calculated the Policy 1 percentage on the whole of those centres. From 2013 this was revised to only the parts within Birmingham, causing a significant decrease in the percentage figures in those centres. They have since remained constant. For 2016, whole centre figures are included in the tables above for comparative purposes.
- 27 out of 73 centres are over 10% A5s when SG uses are included in the calculations.
- 46 are under 10%, of which 7 are in excess of 9% A5s.
- Prior to adoption of the SPD, Class A5 Uses were being approved in the absence of strong policy. Extant consents accounted for some increases in A5 Uses above the 10% threshold in Policy 4 before 2014, but this trend has now ceased.
- Permitted Development changes are showing organic change in centres, which accounts for small changes in percentage rates.
- Recent planning permissions, refusals and appeal decisions indicate that new Class A5 Uses are only being allowed where they are deemed appropriate, in accordance with the SPD.
- Planning permission has been granted for 12 new A5 or A3/A5 uses in centres in 2015-16. There were 11 refusals, and a further 7 applications were withdrawn.
- Outside centres, proposals for new A5 uses continue to be approved where they are in accordance with Policy 6, and refused where they lead to concentrations of over 10%, or clustering. This demonstrates that while the SPD is succeeding in preventing over-concentrations, Policy 4 is not restricting A5 growth in appropriate locations.
- There have been 9 appeals (6 dismissed, 2 allowed), indicating that Policies 4 and 5 are defendable in most cases. In the case of the allowed appeals, the principle of the 10% threshold for A5 Uses was accepted, but the Inspector departed from policy in the interests of the vitality of the centre as a whole.

In summary, the policies in the SPD appear to be meeting their objectives. Continuation of the policies is justified to ensure that additional A5 Uses are permitted only in appropriate locations, whilst ensuring that a balanced mix of uses in centres is maintained.